

In the matter of the Melbourne Metro Rail Project

Planning Panels Victoria

Proponent: Melbourne Metro Rail Authority

**Expert Witness Statement of
Owen Boushel**

Expert of Melbourne Metro Rail Authority

1 Name and address

Owen Boushel, Jacobs, Level 11, 452 Flinders Street, Melbourne

2 Qualifications and experience

Appendix A contains a statement detailing my qualifications and expertise and addressing the matters set out within Planning Panels Victoria's Guide to Expert Evidence.

3 Scope

3.1 Role in Preparation of the EES

My firm Jacobs was responsible for the preparation of the technical report titled "Social and Community Impact Assessment" which is included as Technical Appendix F to the EES.

My role in the preparation of the Social and Community Impact Assessment was to undertake the assessment including the primary and secondary research, risk assessment, impact assessment, development of mitigation measures and environmental performance requirements. I also participated in a number of the wider project engagement activities including attending and managing information sessions, landholder and stakeholder discussions and providing advice on the engagement strategy.

3.2 Instructions

My instructions to prepare this witness statement are set out in Appendix A.

3.3 Process and Methodology

I undertook the following tasks in preparing this expert witness statement:

- Review of the Social and Community Impact Assessment
- Review of relevant submissions received during the public exhibition of the Environment Effects Statement
- Review of Technical Notes 1 to 18
- Review of the sections of Technical Notes 20 and 21 discussing the Flinders Street closure described in Technical Note 13.

4 Findings

4.1 Summary of Opinions

I have reviewed the Social and Community Impact Assessment in preparing this expert witness statement.

Save where otherwise indicated I adopt the Social and Community Impact Assessment as the basis of my evidence before the Inquiry and Advisory Committee.

4.2 Any Additional Work Undertaken Since Exhibition of EES

Nil

4.3 Response to Submissions

I have reviewed the submissions and issues raised in the table below. My detailed response to the matters raised in these submissions is set out in Appendix C.

Issue	Submission No.
Requests that the project "Develop clear processes, protocols and governance arrangements in consultation with Council to manage construction impacts in the precinct, including provision for temporary relocation of residents in certain circumstances".	MM091
Requests that the project "Minimise closures of St Kilda Rd and access restrictions for pedestrians during construction. When closures or restrictions are unavoidable, ensure they are communicated well in advance to the widest possible audience as part of the Transport Demand Management strategy.	MM091
Traffic congestion in the Domain Precinct could impact on access to the Alfred Hospital.	MM082
Construction activities will adversely affect the amenity or access to St Paul's Cathedral and the NGV's Ian Potter Centre.	MM274, MM166
Construction activities and operation of the rail tunnels would have an amenity impact on Melbourne Synagogue, Melbourne Grammar School (MGS), Melbourne Girls Grammar, Royal Botanic Gardens and Christ Church.	MM135, MM159, MM254, MM358
Proposes the addition of the following EPR "During construction, MMRA must consult with MGS to facilitate relocation of facilities / classes to other locations on site should this become necessary and be feasible. (e.g. to move activities away from the St Kilda Rd frontage). The costs of such relocations are to be borne by MMRA."	MM367

Issue	Submission No.
Proposes that Melbourne Grammar School is named as a stakeholder in EPR SC3.	MM367
Submission notes that that, once construction commences, it may no longer be possible for it to assist with the staging of the Moomba Parade, due to disruption of St Kilda Road and normal access arrangements provided to City of Melbourne Moomba organisers.	MM367
Impacts on the Fawkner Park Childcare Centre and South Yarra Senior Citizens Centre.	MM015, MM026, MM046, MM087, MM098, MM148, MM218, MM355, MM365, MM278
Noise and vibration during construction and operation has the potential to affect the health, wellbeing and recovery of patients in the Parkville station precinct.	MM308
Construction impacts on amenity of JJ Holland Park and associated community facilities.	MM027, MM074, MM106, MM205, MM324, MM271, MM334, MM007, MM070, MM238, MM239, MM066, MM078, MM124, MM144, MM211, MM270, MM271
Construction impacts on access to JJ Holland Park and associated community facilities.	MM027, MM069, MM070, MM071, MM075, MM103, MM145, MM179, MM293, MM077, MM097, MM101, MM102, MM111, MM122, MM124, MM144, MM150, MM161, MM205, MM211, MM223, MM238, MM270, MM271, MM307, MM323, MM324, MM331, MM340
Construction of the station has the potential to adversely impact on public safety in proximity to RMIT.	MM180, MM184
Construction truck traffic will adversely affect the safety of pedestrians and other vehicles.	MM025, MM049, MM115, MM170, MM199, MM227, MM305, MM307, MM342, MM357, MM070, MM308 MM310, MM317, MM365
Late night safety in CBD south may decline during construction due to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lowered perceptions of safety and unwillingness to use areas where site hoarding is dominant • Displacement of students and young people to other areas such as Elizabeth Street with existing concentrations of fast food outlets. 	MM365
Construction of the CBD South station would displace homeless people and people who beg to other parts of the CBD.	MM365

Issue	Submission No.
<p>Construction and operational impacts on public safety in the Domain precinct through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • changes to the road network and pedestrian access • loss of emergency access to buildings • changes in air quality • attraction of homeless people or anti-social behavior 	<p>MM061, MM089, MM118, MM190, MM193, MM196, MM201, MM202, MM204, MM276, MM290, MM295, MM319, MM349, MM367, MM370, MM330, MM333, MM346, MM358</p>
<p>Activities at the Fawkner Park southern TBM launch site negatively affect public safety.</p>	<p>MM059, MM141, MM148, MM213, MM278</p>
<p>Construction activities will impact on public safety at the Eastern Portal.</p>	<p>MM266, MM104, MM325</p>
<p>Construction impacts on public safety in the western portal through changes to the road network and pedestrian access</p>	<p>MM031, MM042, MM050, MM092, MM093, MM097, MM102, MM106, MM114, MM122, MM136, MM144, MM145, MM150, MM156, MM158, MM161, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM210, MM223, MM238, MM271, MM282, MM293, MM309, MM077, MM340</p>
<p>Construction activities sever existing networks and disrupt access patterns in the Domain station precinct and Fawkner Park.</p>	<p>MM190, MM215MM226, MM232, MM254, MM370</p>
<p>Construction activities will cause permanent changes to patterns of movements around the University of Melbourne.</p>	<p>MM318</p>
<p>Construction traffic would sever existing networks and disrupt access patterns in the Western Portal.</p>	<p>MM011, MM111, MM156, MM238, MM324</p>
<p>Displacement of Edmund Herring Oval users – EPR SC6 needs to detail the outcomes being sought.</p>	<p>MM365</p>
<p>Displacement of sporting clubs Submission notes that that the EPR significantly underestimates the difficulty of obtaining access to alternate sporting venues to replace Edmund Herring Oval. It proposes to include the following EPR “MMRA should make arrangements with City of Melbourne for there to be a direct replacement of these facilities at Fawkner Park or another nearby reasonable alternative.</p>	<p>MM367</p>
<p>Concerns about impacts on Fawkner Park including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • change in land use • loss of trees • disruption of amenity 	<p>MM370, MM002, MM046, MM059, MM212, MM213, MM365, MM322, MM204,</p>

Issue	Submission No.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> disruption to passive and active recreation 	
<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment does not provide sufficient information to understand the impact of the concept design on RMIT, its staff or students. An EPR is required to address this.</p>	MM180
<p>Construction activities will adversely affect household amenity in the Arden precinct.</p>	MM19, MM305, MM063, MM259, MM365, MM049, MM115, MM199, MM079, MM194
<p>Concerns about changes to amenity and impacts on dwellings due to the construction and operation of tunnels in North Melbourne.</p>	MM090, MM095, MM119, MM129, MM203, MM217, MM207, MM228, MM350, MM146, MM155, MM285, MM250, MM253, MM299, MM300, MM301
<p>Impacts on household amenity in CBD south and the loss of existing views.</p>	MM235, MM236, MM281, MM297
<p>Impacts on residential amenity in the Domain precinct and Toorak Road.</p>	MM008, MM176, MM190, MM229, MM276, MM283, MM284, MM289, MM141, MM312, MM356, MM137, MM183, MM190, MM204, MM213, MM226, MM242, MM252, MM254, MM268, MM232, MM356, MM358, MM240, MM241, MM267, MM34, MM370, MM059, MM080, MM096, MM118, MM289, MM290, MM298, MM306, MM311, MM313, MM315, MM319, MM330, MM333, MM374
<p>Impacts on residential amenity in the Eastern Portal precinct.</p>	MM010, MM264, MM012, MM019, MM104, MM164, MM325, MM348, MM352, MM266, MM339, MM354
<p>Impacts on residential amenity in Parkville</p>	MM294, MM100
<p>Impacts on residential amenity in the Western Portal precinct.</p>	MM007, MM050, MM014, MM101, MM106, MM111, MM161, MM230, MM238, MM239, MM270, MM011, MM042, MM077, MM078, MM092, MM097, MM120, MM122, MM124, MM140, MM152, MM154, MM156, MM165, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM192, MM205, MM210, MM069, MM070, MM072, MM075, MM093, MM102, MM150, MM158, MM271, MM309, MM323, MM324, MM149
<p>Need to minimise impacts on the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve and Shrine of Remembrance activities</p>	MM173, MM175, MM176, MM193, MM249, MM256
<p>Impact on the St Kilda Road streetscape</p>	MM151, MM176, MM229, MM234,

Issue	Submission No.
	MM242, MM215, MM004, MM089, MM128, MM137, MM153, MM172, MM173, MM175, MM176, MM183, MM188, MM189, MM190, MM193, MM196, MM200, MM201, MM202, MM214, MM215, MM218, MM226, MM232, MM240, MM241, MM252, MM256, MM260, MM267, MM268, MM283, MM284, MM290, MM298, MM306, MM311, MM312, MM313, MM315, MM319, MM322, MM333, MM336, MM343, MM346, MM349, MM365, MM370, MM374, MM356, MM244
Uncertainty about potential project impacts on the ability of landowners to plan for the future	MM207, MM228, MM253, MM299, MM300, MM301, MM266, MM270, MM330
Construction activities will result in a loss of access to residences	MM049, MM229, MM012, MM240, MM266, MM080, MM089, MM096, MM137, MM153, MM183, MM196, MM199, MM202, MM232, MM204, MM211, MM241, MM268, MM276, MM283, MM289, MM290, MM298, MM313, MM349, MM306, MM330, MM346, MM244
Parking availability	MM025, MM049, MM066, MM093, MM259, MM310, MM080, MM094, MM118, MM135, MM153, MM190, MM196, MM201, MM202, MM204, MM218, MM226, MM232, MM240, MM249, MM260, MM267, MM268, MM276, MM283, MM289, MM290, MM312, MM315, MM333, MM349, MM356, MM367, MM370, MM008, MM059, MM213, MM104, MM266, MM339, MM348, MM352, MM354, MM294, MM014, MM033, MM070, MM071, MM086, MM092, MM099, MM101, MM103, MM110, MM120, MM122, MM136, MM140, MM144, MM145, MM154, MM156, MM158, MM165, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM211, MM230, MM238, MM270, MM271, MM282, MM293, MM331, MM314, MM325, MM340
Loss of access to the Albert Road Reserve during construction	MM229, MM252, MM312, MM183, MM196, MM240, MM260, MM268, MM311, MM315, MM370, MM256, MM267, MM322
Property acquisition, and associated displacement	MM371, MM014, MM033, MM042,

Issue	Submission No.
of residents	MM045, MM047, MM050, MM056, MM071, MM072, MM078, MM086, MM092, MM093, MM097, MM099, MM101, MM102, MM106, MM110, MM111, MM113, MM114, MM120, MM122, MM124, MM125, MM136, MM140, MM154, MM156, MM158, MM161, MM165, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM223, MM230, MM238, MM239, MM243, MM248, MM270, MM271, MM282, MM286, MM293, MM302, MM307, MM323, MM331, MM340
Loss of city square during construction and ongoing changes	MM317, MM304, MM310
Amenity impacts on University Square	MM100, MM285, MM364
Loss of South Yarra Siding Reserve and Osborne Reserve during construction	MM266, MM264, MM352
The project need to continue to engage closely with affected landholders, households and stakeholders throughout planning and construction and establish a complaints management system	MM350, MM367, MM203, MM095, MM164, MM250, MM259, MM289, MM354
Reinstatement of acquired land may result in developments inconsistent with community aspirations	MM124, MM111, MM019, MM164, MM264
Social impact study does not demonstrate how individuals feel about using underground stations	MM023
Business impacts	MM037, MM038, MM058, MM085, MM157, MM163, MM184, MM186, MM263, MM372

4.4 Review of MMRA Technical Notes

I have reviewed MMRA Technical Notes 1 – 18. This section contains a discussion of the contents of the notes with implications for the Social and Community Impact Assessment.

Technical Note 9 Modification - Access Ramp to Business Park

Technical Appendix D Transport (Section 8.5.3) notes that construction vehicle access routes will be contained to Kensington Road and Childers Street with an average of 50 trucks per day and a peak of 62. The closure of Childers Street would require rerouting of traffic accessing the business estate. Vehicles would be encouraged to use the Lloyd Street to access the park but medium or large trucks would use a temporary access ramp between Tennyson Street and McClure Road. This would result in no change to the Social and Community Impact Assessment. However, if local traffic cannot be encouraged to use the Lloyd Street entrance to the business estate and instead uses the

temporary access ramp, it is likely that there would be a limited amenity impact on dwellings on Altona Street or on other streets that traffic diverts onto during the day.

Technical Note 12 Modification - Franklin Street Legacy Condition

The Concept Design has been modified to allow reinstatement of two traffic lanes on Franklin Street. This would limit but not preclude the opportunity to reinstate Franklin Street as a recreational space for the community identified in Section 11.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment.

Technical Note 13 Modification - Flinders Street Temporary Construction Work Area

The project requires an additional temporary construction work site on Flinders Street on the east side of Swanston Street. It also requires a larger construction and laydown area within Federation Square including the site of the western shard, which is proposed to be demolished and reinstated.

There is the potential for this modification to result in a four to five month closure of westbound traffic lanes on Flinders Street between Russell Street and Swanston Street as a consequence of these works.

Section 11.5.2.3 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that during construction, there would also be disruptions in access to the northern end of Federation Square as an entrance is constructed, however, it is anticipated that the functions of the visitors centre could be maintained either in situ or elsewhere in Federation Square during construction. Under the proposed modification, the functions of the visitors centre would need to be maintained elsewhere. Further, pedestrian access to the northern end of Federation Square would be further reduced, creating a barrier for people wishing to access ACMI or the Ian Potter Centre (NGV). Limiting this impact, the Ian Potter Centre and the ACMI facilities are both accessible via the centre of Federation Square with direct access to Flinders Street Station.

The closure of two lanes on Flinders Street for up to five months was not assessed in the Social and Community Impact Assessment. If this occurs simultaneous to the reduction in lanes on St Kilda Road, this could create a barrier to accessing the CBD its facilities and services. Reducing the likelihood of this impact is the number of alternative transport options available for people travelling into the CBD.

The preferred transport solution for this closure proposed in Technical Note 21 is a full closure of the westbound lane of Flinders Street and associated diversion of traffic onto Russell Street. This could increase traffic on Flinders Lane and Collins Streets. Increased traffic on Flinders Lane could create a safety concern for pedestrians and other users, especially if there is an increase in pedestrian movements associated with the creation of an alternative open space adjacent to St Pauls Cathedral.

Technical Note 15 Modification - Expanded construction areas in Domain

This Technical Note relates to the expansion of temporary construction work sites as follows:

- Albert Road surrounding the Albert Road Reserve – to provide an additional area within the Albert Road Reserve required for the realignment of St Kilda Road during construction staging
- Bowen Lane – to allow for construction that facilitates access from Bowen Lane to St Kilda Road
- Bowen Crescent – to facilitate the relocation of the emergency access structure from the western side of St Kilda Road to the eastern end of Bowen Crescent (near the intersection of St Kilda Road)
- Bromby Street – to allow for construction of access to the Melbourne Grammar School car park from Bromby Street, and undertake works that enables a left hand turn from Bromby Street to St Kilda Road (access currently truncated).

Movement of the construction area closer to residences on Albert Road, Bowen Lane and Bowen Crescent is likely to generate concern about potential amenity and access impacts for residences fronting these work sites. The loss of parking is also likely to be of concern to the community if it is perceived as a barrier to access for visitors to the area. Reducing the likelihood of this impact is the range of alternative transport options in the area such as public transport that would continue to operate during construction. Further, traffic management and other mitigation will be in place to reduce impacts on amenity and access.

The opening of Bromby Street to Melbourne Grammar School traffic is likely to be of concern to people living on this and adjoining streets as it would result in an increase in traffic, particularly during pick up and drop off periods during school times. These concerns are likely to be compounded if traffic that currently uses Domain Road begins to use Bromby Street. To reduce this impact, MMRA are working with the City of Melbourne to develop road designs that would deter non-school or local traffic through the use of traffic measures such as speed humps.

Technical Note 16 Modification – Removal of Fawkner Park TBM Southern Launch

The project is no longer intending to use Fawkner Park as a TBM southern launch site. This would limit construction activities in Fawkner Park to the northeast corner for the emergency access shaft.

This will largely reduce or avoid impacts on the facilities in the park including the child care centre, tennis courts and South Yarra aged care centre. This will also minimise amenity impacts on the surrounding community with construction activities contained to the north east corner of the park around the emergency access shaft.

4.5 Environmental Performance Requirements

I have reviewed the EPRs relevant to social and community and made the following changes (in red).

EPR No.	Original EPR	Recommended EPR	Reason for Modification
SC3	<p>Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. The plan must include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Measures to minimise impacts to the development and/or operation of existing facilities • Measures for providing advance notice of significant milestones, changed traffic conditions, periods of predicted high noise and vibration 	<p>Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. The plan must include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Measures to minimise impacts to the development and/or operation of existing facilities • Measures for providing advance notice of significant milestones, changed traffic conditions, periods of predicted high noise and vibration 	<p>Recognise Melbourne Grammar School as a key stakeholder directly interfacing with construction activities in the Domain station precinct</p>


EPR No.	Original EPR	Recommended EPR	Reason for Modification
	<p>activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Process for registering and management of complaints • Measures to address any other matters which are of concern or interest to them. <p>The plan would consider each precinct and station location in detail. Stakeholders to be considered in the plan include (but are not limited to):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Municipalities • Potentially affected residents • Potentially affected businesses • Recreation, sporting and community groups and facilities • Royal Melbourne Hospital, Victorian Comprehensive Cancer Centre, Peter Doherty Institute and other health and medical facilities • The University of Melbourne • RMIT • Fawkner Park Children's Centre and Kindergarten • South Yarra Senior Citizens Centre • Other public facilities in proximity 	<p>activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Process for registering and management of complaints • Measures to address any other matters which are of concern or interest to them. <p>The plan would consider each precinct and station location in detail. Stakeholders to be considered in the plan include (but are not limited to):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Municipalities • Potentially affected residents • Potentially affected businesses • Recreation, sporting and community groups and facilities • Royal Melbourne Hospital, Victorian Comprehensive Cancer Centre, Peter Doherty Institute and other health and medical facilities • The University of Melbourne • RMIT • Melbourne Grammar School • Fawkner Park Children's Centre and Kindergarten • South Yarra Senior Citizens Centre • Other public facilities in proximity. 	
T3	<p>Active Transport (Construction Phase)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop and implement transport management measures in consultation with relevant authorities for cyclists and 	<p>Active Transport (Construction Phase)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop and implement transport management measures in consultation with relevant authorities for cyclists and 	<p>To highlight the importance of engaging with Melbourne University in traffic management</p>

EPR No.	Original EPR	Recommended EPR	Reason for Modification
	<p>pedestrians to maintain connectivity throughout construction for road and shared path users including (but not limited to): JJ Holland Park, South Kensington station, Laurens Street, Grattan Street, Franklin Street (including RMIT facilities), Swanston Street, Flinders Street, St Kilda Road, Domain Road, Domain Parklands, Albert Road, Toorak Road, Fawkner Park, Osborne Street, William Street and Chapel Street</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement active control at construction work site access points to maintain safety by avoiding potential conflicts between trucks, pedestrians and cyclists • In consultation with the City of Melbourne, provide suitable routes for cyclists and pedestrians throughout construction to and maintain connectivity for road and shared path users around JJ Holland Park and South Kensington station. 	<p>pedestrians to maintain connectivity throughout construction for road and shared path users including (but not limited to): JJ Holland Park, South Kensington station, Laurens Street, Grattan Street (including Melbourne University facilities), Franklin Street (including RMIT facilities), Swanston Street, Flinders Street, St Kilda Road, Domain Road, Domain Parklands, Albert Road, Toorak Road, Fawkner Park, Osborne Street, William Street and Chapel Street</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement active control at construction work site access points to maintain safety by avoiding potential conflicts between trucks, pedestrians and cyclists • In consultation with the City of Melbourne, provide suitable routes for cyclists and pedestrians throughout construction to and maintain connectivity for road and shared path users around JJ Holland Park and South Kensington station. 	<p>planning in order to minimize impacts on existing operations</p>
SC6	<p>Develop a relocation strategy for sports clubs and other formal users of directly impacted recreational facilities.</p>	<p>In consultation with the City of Melbourne, develop a relocation strategy for sports clubs and other formal users of directly impacted recreational facilities. This strategy should aim, where available, to identify local alternative facilities for formal recreational users displaced from recreational facilities by the project. This strategy should avoid displacing existing users at alternative</p>	<p>To make the objective of the EPR clearer</p>

EPR No.	Original EPR	Recommended EPR	Reason for Modification
		facilities.	

5 Declaration

I have made all the inquiries that I believe are desirable and appropriate and no matters of significance which I regard as relevant have to my knowledge been withheld from the Panel.

Signed 
Dated 12 August 2016

Annexure A – Response to PPV Guide to Expert Evidence

Expert's Qualifications

I hold the degree of Bachelor of Arts and a Master of Applied Social Research from Monash University.

Professional Associations

International Association of Public Participation

Employment History and Achievements

Jacobs (formerly SKM), Social Scientist, 2008 – Ongoing

Australian Bureau of Statistics, Social Statistics, 2006 – 2008

Expertise to Make Report

I am a Senior Social Scientist at Jacobs. Over the past ten years I have undertaken social research, led social impact assessments and developed social impact management plans for projects. This includes assessments of linear projects in the transport, extractive, power and water sectors. I have undertaken social impact assessments or developed social impact management plans for a number of projects including:

- Melbourne Metro Rail Project
- Princes Highway Duplication – Winchelsea to Colac
- Bulla Bypass and Melbourne Airport Link (MAL)
- Springvale Road Grade Separation Business Case
- M39 Watermain replacement
- Northern Extension of the Mornington Peninsula Freeway
- Airport Drive and Steele Creek
- Arrow LNG Plant
- Woori Coal Mine Project
- Taroom Coal Mine Project
- Baralaba Coal Mine Project
- Baralaba Coal Mine Expansion
- Surat Gas Pipeline
- Avalon Airport Rail Link
- Yallourn Power Station
- Dual Gas project

Other Significant Contributors to the Report (if any)

There were no other significant contributors to this expert witness statement.

Instructions to Prepare Report



Mr Owen Boushel
Senior Social Scientist
Jacobs Group (Australia) Pty Ltd
Level 11, 452 Flinders Street
Melbourne VIC 3000
own.boushel@jacobs.com

29 July 2016
Matter 82449055
By Email

Dear Mr Boushel

Confidential and Privileged

**Melbourne Metro Rail Project
Further Instructions Concerning Preparation of Expert Witness
Statement**

We continue to act as legal advisors to the Melbourne Metro Rail Authority (Authority) in connection with the Melbourne Metro Rail Project (Project).

1 Directions Hearing

A directions hearing was conducted by the Inquiry and Advisory Committee (IAC) appointed in respect of the Project on 26 July 2016.

The IAC made the following directions relevant to the preparation and circulation of your expert witness statement and your participation in the upcoming hearing:

- (a) The hearing will commence on 22 August 2016 and conclude on or around 5 October 2016;
- (b) The hearing will be conducted at the Mercure Hotel at 13 Spring Street, Melbourne;
- (c) MMRA will likely be allocated ten days to complete its principal case, between 22 August 2016 and 5 September 2016;
- (d) Expert witness statements must be prepared in accordance with Planning Panel Victoria's Guide to Expert Evidence and must be submitted to the IAC in electronic and hard copy formats by 10 am 12 August;
- (e) Expert conclaves in respect of the following disciplines are to be conducted in the week commencing 15 August 2016. The experts participating in these conclaves are to prepare a statement which sets out matters upon which they agree and matters upon which they disagree relevant to their area of expertise. These statements will be provided to the IAC at the commencement of the hearing on 22 August 2016. The IAC has directed that the following disciplines be the subject of an expert conclave:
 - (1) Traffic;
 - (2) Heritage;
 - (3) Acoustics and vibration;
 - (4) Arboriculture;
 - (5) Land Contamination;
 - (6) Groundwater; and

Doc 54962628.6



(7) Air Quality.

It is anticipated that the IAC will prepare a timetable in respect of the upcoming hearing which will identify the date and time that you will be required to present your evidence. We will advise you of these details when they are made available to us.

The purpose of this letter is to provide you with further instructions concerning the preparation of your expert witness statement, and to identify additional matters that you will need to address in preparing for your appearance before the IAC.

2 MMRA Technical Notes

Throughout the course of the hearing MMRA will prepare technical notes in response to requests for information made by the IAC or in respect of matters arising out of submissions made to the IAC or following consultation with relevant stakeholders (MMRA Technical Notes). The purpose of the MMRA Technical Notes is to set out MMRA's position in respect of particular issues or matters that arise throughout the course of the hearing.

The first group of MMRA Technical Notes – numbered 1 - 18 – was provided to the IAC at the Directions Hearing. Copies of those MMRA Technical Notes are enclosed.

MMRA Technical Notes 1 – 8 were prepared in response to a request for information made by the IAC on 13 July 2016 (a copy of which is attached). MMRA Technical Notes 9 – 18 document modifications to the Concept Design supported by MMRA. The annexures to MMRA Technical Note 8 - IAC Response - Item 8 Soil and Rock Bore Logs and CBD South Update include bore logs which are voluminous and we consider unlikely to be relevant to your area of expertise. For this reason they have not been included with these further instructions.

You are instructed to review the enclosed MMRA Technical Notes and, insofar as they are relevant to your area expertise, consider whether they give rise to a need to modify any of the proposed EPRs relevant to your area of expertise.

It is anticipated that MMRA will prepare further technical notes both in advance of, and during, the hearing. You may be instructed to review further technical notes prior to the completion of your witness statement or prior to giving evidence before the IAC.

3 Environmental Performance Requirements

In preparing your expert witness statement you are instructed to critically evaluate the proposed EPRs that are relevant to your area of expertise. In doing so you should consider whether the EPRs establish an appropriate framework to govern the construction and operation of the Project if it ultimately differs from the Concept Design (but is still situated primarily within the Project Boundary as shown in the EES Map Book).

Your report should identify any modifications to the EPRs that you consider necessary.

4 Precinct Reference Group - Parkville

MMRA has facilitated the establishment of a Precinct Reference Group (PRG) to co-ordinate ongoing consultation regarding construction impacts of the Metro Tunnel project in Parkville and stakeholder input on other matters.

The purpose of the PRG is to provide a forum for effective consultation and coordination between MMRA, the contractors (engaged to undertake enabling and early works, and Metro Tunnel works) and the Health, Research and Education Institutions in the Parkville precinct. The forum is also intended to include all relevant public agencies, including road authorities, public transport providers and the Victorian Department of Health & Human Services. Participation in the PRG is voluntary and membership of the PRG does not limit any matters participants may wish to raise before the IAC. The MMRA envisages that the PRG will assist in co-ordinating information, understanding specific requirements of



members and how these requirements relate to the Environmental Performance Requirements arising from the EES and tender documentation.

It is envisaged that MMRA will suggest the establishment of the PRG be a performance requirement associated with any project approval.

Copies of the letters inviting participation in the PRG, which include the proposed members of the PRG are enclosed. We are instructed that the first meeting of the PRG will be conducted on 2 August 2016. We are instructed that at the first meeting of the PRG the MMRA intends to provide details of proposed protocols and governance of the PRG for discussion prior to formalisation of those details. Please advise us if you have require any further information in relation to the PRG and we will seek instructions.

5 Consolidated Instructions

For the purposes of assisting you to respond to the matters identified in Planning Panel Victoria's Guide to Expert Evidence (Guide) we have included a consolidated list of the instructions provided to you by Herbert Smith Freehills in respect of the preparation of your expert witness statement.

- 1 Prepare a witness statement that:
 - addresses all matters set out in the Guide in particular those matters listed under the heading 'content and form of expert's report';
 - describes any technical report that you reviewed or relied on in the preparation of your witness statement;
 - states whether you adopt the findings in the exhibited report, identifying any departure from the findings and opinions you express in your report exhibited with the EES;
 - includes any key assumptions made in preparing your report;
 - states whether the exhibited report is incomplete or inaccurate in any respect
- 2 Address or respond to each of the public submissions we forwarded to you in your witness statement;
- 3 Review the enclosed MMRA Technical Notes and consider whether they give rise to a need to modify proposed EPRs relevant to your area of expertise; and
- 4 Consider whether the EPRs relevant to your area of expertise establish an appropriate framework to govern the construction and operation of the Project if it ultimately differs from the Concept Design.

6 Template

We have prepared a template to assist you prepare and order your expert witness statement. You should treat the template as an aid and should not consider yourself constrained by it if you would prefer to structure your statement differently.

7 PowerPoint Presentation

We had previously instructed that you that you should prepare a PowerPoint presentation of your evidence to the Panel. Given the serious time constraints for the IAC hearing, a PowerPoint presentation may not be required by all witnesses. We will advise you closer to the hearing date whether a PowerPoint presentation will be required and, if so, the length of such presentation.

8. Important dates

We confirm the following dates in respect of the upcoming hearing:

- (a) Final witness statements due to Herbert Smith Freehills on **10 August 2016**;



HERBERT
SMITH
FREEHILLS

0 8. Important dates

- (b) Potential participation in expert conclave in the week commencing **15 August 2016**;
- (c) A PowerPoint presentation of your evidence for presentation at the Hearing due **17 August 2016**;
- (d) Panel Hearing: **Monday 22 August to 5 October 2016**.

As noted above we will provide you with further details concerning your participation in the hearing upon receipt of the timetable from the IAC.

If you have any questions about this letter, your role in the hearing, or the approval process, and would like to discuss your availability or the content of your report, please contact us.

Yours sincerely

Tim Power
Partner
Herbert Smith Freehills
+61 3 9288 1484
+61 419 104 681
tim.power@hsf.com

Michelle Keen
Special Counsel
Herbert Smith Freehills
+61 3 9288 1824
+61 439 950 963
michelle.keen@hsf.com

Herbert Smith Freehills LLP and its subsidiaries and Herbert Smith Freehills, an Australian Partnership ABN 98 773 882 646, are separate member firms of the International legal practice known as Herbert Smith Freehills.

Attached

- 1 Pro forma Expert Witness Statement

Identity of Persons who have Carried out Tests or Experiments upon which Reliance has been Placed (if any)

Nil

Reports Relied Upon to Prepare Expert Witness Statement

- Technical Appendix D Transport
- Technical Appendix F Social and Community
- Technical Appendix H Air Quality
- Technical Appendix I Noise and Vibration
- Technical Notes 1-18
- EES Chapter 6 Project Description

Annexure B – Curriculum Vitae



Owen Boushel

SENIOR SOCIAL SCIENTIST

Owen is an experienced practitioner with specialist skills in community and stakeholder engagement, social research, social impact assessment and social management planning.

He has extensive experience undertaking community and stakeholder engagement for projects in the transport, extractive, water and power sectors. He works closely with his clients to develop a targeted approach that is evidenced based, responds to issues of significance and addresses the expectations of influential stakeholders.

He has also spent a significant part of his career undertaking social research and social planning to support business cases, environmental studies, planning and construction of capital projects and policy.

EDUCATION/QUALIFICATIONS

Master of Applied Social Research,
Monash University 2008

Bachelor of Arts (Sociology), Monash
University 2002

REGISTRATIONS/ CERTIFICATIONS

Certificate in Public Participation
2011

Member of the International
Association of Public Participation
(IAP2)

Areas of Expertise

- Community and stakeholder engagement
- Expert witness
- Social impact assessment
- Social impact management planning
- Social research

Relevant Project Experience

Melbourne Metro Rail Link (Melbourne Metro Rail Authority)

Title: Social Impact Assessment lead

Description: Undertook the social impact assessment and provided engagement advice for the Melbourne Metro Rail Project

Princes Highway Duplication – Winchelsea to Colac (VicRoads)

Role: Senior Social Scientist and Project Manager

Description: Led the social impact assessment, undertook consultation and social surveys with landholders, community groups and other stakeholders impacted by the proposed duplication.

Bulla Bypass and Melbourne Airport Link (VicRoads)

Title: Senior Social Scientist and expert witness

Description: Led the social impact assessment and appeared as the expert witness for VicRoads at the panel hearing.

Springvale Road Grade Separation Business Case (VicRoads)

Title: Senior Social Scientist

Description: A level crossing removal and station rebuild on Springvale Road, Springvale. Owen undertook the social impact assessment to inform the business case.

Curriculum Vitae



Owen Boushel

SENIOR SOCIAL SCIENTIST

Avalon Airport Rail Link (DTPLI)

Role: Senior Social Scientist and Stakeholder Engagement

Description: Undertook a social impact assessment of a series of rail corridors for a potential rail alignment to Avalon Airport

Arrow LNG Plant and Surat Gas Project, Gladstone (Arrow Energy)

Role: Senior Social Scientist

Description: An environmental impact assessment to gain state approval for the construction and operation of a proposed LNG Plant and associated gas pipeline in Gladstone. Owen led the social impact assessment and engaged with local and state government agencies, community and industry groups on a management plan governing the introduction of approximately 3,000 workers to Gladstone. Owen was also responsible for the supplementary social assessment of the Surat Gas Project to address issues raised during the exhibition process for the project.

Baralaba South, Woori, Collingwood and Taroom Coal Mine Projects, Central Queensland (Cockatoo Coal)

Role: Senior Social Scientist

Description: Led four social impact assessments and social impact management plans for a series of coal mines and associated infrastructure across central Queensland.

M39 water main replacement options study (Melbourne Water)

Role: Social Scientist

Description: Undertook a social impact assessment determining the constraints and opportunities associated with six proposed pipeline alignments, one of which travelled through Fawkner Park.

Stockyard Hill (Origin Energy)

Role: Social Scientist

Description: A social impact assessment of a proposed terminal station and a series of proposed transmission line corridors

Dual Gas Power Station (HRL)

Role: Social Scientist

Description: Social Impact Assessment of a proposed brown coal fired power station in the Latrobe Valley.

Yallourn CCGT Power station (TruEnergy)

Role: Social Scientist

Description: Undertook a Social Impact Assessment of a proposed CCGT power station, associated gas pipeline and transmission line corridor.

Curriculum Vitae



Owen Boushel

SENIOR SOCIAL SCIENTIST

Macarthur Wind Farm

Client: TruEnergy

Role: Social Scientist

Description: Social Impact Study of a proposed wind farm in western Victoria.

Other relevant community engagement experience includes:

- Melbourne Metro Rail Project (MMRA)
- East West Link – Western Section (DTPLI)
- Melbourne Rail Link (DTPLI)
- Cranbourne Pakenham Rail Corridor Project (DEDJTR)
- Ringwood Terminal Station (SP AusNet)
- Heatherton Terminal Station Redevelopment (SP AusNet)
- Brunswick Terminal Stations Redevelopment (AusNet Services)
- Rail Upgrades for Geelong Port Project (ARTC)
- Hinze Dam Stage 3 Upgrade (Hinze Dam Alliance)
- Water Supply Alliance (Melbourne Water)

Annexure C – Detailed Response to Submissions

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
Requests that the project “Develop clear processes, protocols and governance arrangements in consultation with Council to manage construction impacts in the precinct, including provision for temporary relocation of residents in certain circumstances	MM091	<p>A number of the EPR’s require consultation with local government when addressing project impacts. The following Environmental Performance Requirement (EPR) have been recommended to manage the need for relocation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity during the day for shift workers) • Loss of access 	No change proposed to existing EPR’s
Requests that the project “Minimise closures of St Kilda Rd and access restrictions for pedestrians during construction. When closures or	MM091	<p>Section 12.1 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access would be maintained around construction zones for the duration of the works.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage communications with impacted communities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise 	No change proposed to existing EPR’s

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
restrictions are unavoidable, ensure they are communicated well in advance to the widest possible audience as part of the Transport Demand Management strategy		<p>them of the planned construction activities and project progress. The plan must include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Measures to minimise impacts to the development and/or operation of existing facilities • Measures for providing advance notice of significant milestones, changed traffic conditions, periods of predicted high noise and vibration activities • Process for registering and management of complaints • Measures to address any other matters which are of concern or interest to them 	
Traffic congestion in the Domain Precinct could impact on access to the Alfred Hospital	MM082	<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment did not consider emergency access to the Alfred Hospital given its distance from the Domain Precinct (1.5 km away). Traffic diversions would result in delay on St Kilda Road which could have a flow on impact on access to hospital.</p> <p>Should congestion on St Kilda Road affect access to the Alfred Hospital the findings of Section 10.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment can be equally applied to the Alfred Hospital. Access to medical facilities, particularly emergency facilities, needs to be maintained throughout construction. However, there may be periods in which access would be affected due to traffic congestion on St Kilda Road (discussed further in Technical Appendix D Transport). Delays associated with traffic congestion are likely to be most serious for emergency vehicles and people accessing the emergency departments at the Alfred Hospital. However, with appropriate lead times for notification and collaboration with the hospital in the precinct on traffic management and the timing of activities, the severity of this impact could be reduced.</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Construction activities will	MM274, MM166	Section 11.5.2.6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that construction activities, in particular vibration from road headers would impact on the amenity of the	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
adversely affect the amenity or access to St Paul's Cathedral and the NGV Ian Potter Centre		<p>Cathedral and Federation Square.</p> <p>Section 11.5.2.3 notes that during construction, that while there will be impact on Federation Square in which the NGV Ian Potter Centre is located, disruptions in access will largely be contained the northern end of the square.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values 	
Construction activities and operation of the rail tunnels would have an amenity impact on Melbourne Synagogue, Melbourne Grammar School, Melbourne Girls Grammar, Royal Botanic Gardens and Christ Church	MM135, MM159, MM254, MM358	<p>Section 7.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the Concept Design may result in short-term acoustic or vibration impacts on valued spaces or social infrastructure while the TBM travels along the alignment. It may also generate wider concern where the tunnels would travel under structures perceived to be more vulnerable to vibration.</p> <p>Section 12.5.1.6 notes that the project would generate large volumes of noise and dust during working hours and that this would have a sustained amenity impact on the Domain station precinct.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values	
Proposes the addition of the following EPR “During construction, MMRA must consult with MGS to facilitate relocation of facilities / classes to other locations on site should this become necessary and be feasible (e.g. to move activities away from the St Kilda Rd frontage). The costs of such relocations are to be borne by MMRA.”	MM367	The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Proposes that Melbourne Grammar School is named as a stakeholder in EPR SC3	MM367	Agreed	Amend EPR SC3 to name Melbourne Grammar School as a specific stakeholder to be considered in the plan

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
Submission notes that that, once construction commences, it may no longer be possible for it to assist with the staging of the Moomba Parade, due to disruption of St Kilda Road and normal access arrangements provided to City of Melbourne Moomba organisers.	MM367	<p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC5 Work with relevant local councils to plan for and coordinate with key stakeholders during major public events 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Impacts on the Fawkner Park Childcare Centre and South Yarra Senior Citizens Centre	MM015, MM026, MM046, MM087, MM098, MM148, MM218, MM355, MM365, MM278	Technical Note 16 states that Fawkner Park is no longer required as a TBM launch site for the project, avoiding or minimising most project impacts on these facilities and their users.	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Noise and vibration during construction and operation has the potential to affect the health, wellbeing	MM308	Section 10.5.1.5 acknowledges that construction would likely have a sustained amenity impact on the Victorian Comprehensive Cancer Centre, Royal Melbourne Hospital and the Peter Doherty Institute. However, the sensitivity of the Royal Melbourne Hospital and Royal Women's Hospital to amenity impacts associated with construction is potentially reduced by their recent exposure to the construction of the Victorian Comprehensive	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
and recovery of patients in the Parkville Station precinct		<p>Cancer Centre that would have also generated sustained noise, dust and vibration.</p> <p>It also notes that construction would have an amenity impact on the Peter Doherty Institute, particularly for facilities facing Barry, Berkeley and Grattan Streets for staff, researchers and students. While it is likely that with appropriate treatment, these impacts could be reduced, the sustained impact associated with the noise of works would still impact people within these facilities.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue: SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress.</p>	
Construction impacts on amenity of JJ Holland Park and associated community facilities	MM027, MM074, MM106, MM205, MM324, MM271, MM334, MM007, MM070, MM238, MM239, MM066, MM078, MM124, MM144, MM211, MM270, MM271	<p>Section 8.5.1.5 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that during construction both options are likely to affect the amenity of JJ Holland Park. It also notes that users of JJ Holland Park are likely to be less sensitive given the areas of the park most exposed to amenity impacts are playing fields and a skate park valued primarily for their ability to host sports rather than their amenity value such as an ornamental park.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Construction impacts on access to JJ Holland Park and associated community facilities	MM027, MM069, MM070, MM071, MM075, MM103, MM145, MM179, MM293, MM077, MM097, MM101, MM102, MM111, MM122, MM124, MM144, MM150, MM161, MM205, MM211,	<p>Table 6.1 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment considered it unlikely that construction activities would act as a barrier to accessing J.J Holland Park.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
	MM223, MM238, MM270, MM271, MM307, MM323, MM324, MM331, MM340		
Construction of the station has the potential to adversely impact on public safety in proximity to RMIT	CBD North MM180, MM184	<p>Section 11.5.1.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the interface between users of the CBD North station precinct and construction activities could also be perceived to impact on safety. Pedestrians under the influence of alcohol or other drugs leaving licensed entertainment venues such as bars or pubs or special events at RMIT, those with mobility impairments or children are vulnerable to this. It also notes that appropriate traffic management and engagement with the relevant facilities and users would reduce this impact.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. RMIT is listed within this EPR as a specific stakeholder to be considered in this plan. • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Construction truck traffic will adversely affect the safety of pedestrians and other vehicles	Arden MM025, MM049, MM115, MM170, MM199, MM227, MM305, MM307, MM342, MM357 Parkville MM070, MM308	<p>Sections 9.5.1.1 and 9.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment recognised that construction traffic could be perceived by pedestrians and the community as a safety hazard, particularly where trucks are traveling to and from Parkville and other station sites or where they cannot use CityLink. This includes other road users and anyone participating in this community.</p> <p>Section 10.5.1.5 of the social and community assessment notes that the interface between users of the precinct and construction activities could be perceived to impact safety. People attending the hospitals for medical treatment, pedestrians under the influence of</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
	<p>CBD South MM310, MM317, MM365</p>	<p>alcohol or other drugs leaving licensed entertainment venues such as bars or special events at the University of Melbourne, those with mobility impairments or children would be vulnerable to this. Community concerns about the safety of truck movements that may lead to changes in local access patterns. However, appropriate traffic management and communication would reduce this impact.</p> <p>Section 11.5.2.6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the interface between users of the precinct and construction activities could be perceived to impact on safety. Pedestrians under the influence of alcohol or other drugs leaving licensed entertainment venues such as bars or nightclubs, those with mobility impairments or children are vulnerable to this. Appropriate traffic management and engagement with the relevant facilities and users would reduce this impact.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	
<p>Late night safety in CBD south may decline during construction due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lowered perceptions of safety and unwillingness to 	<p>MM365</p>	<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment did not consider whether the number of late night visitors to the CBD South precinct would change due to the concerns about safety. However, some of these concerns are likely to be addressed through an improvement in passive surveillance with the presence of a 24 hour work force. It is agreed that further concerns could be mitigated by effective lighting, way-finding, well cared for amenity, and other elements.</p> <p>Displacement of late night visitors to the CBD South station precinct would also be addressed in part through the provision of alternative open space in proximity to Flinders</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
<p>use areas where site hoarding is dominant</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Displacement of students and young people to other areas such as Elizabeth Street with existing concentrations of fast food outlets. 		<p>Street Station.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress SC4 Prior to main works or shaft construction commencing, work with the City of Melbourne to identify possible alternative areas of public open space for community use during the construction phase to minimise the impacts of loss of existing public open space that are to be utilised as construction worksites. 	
<p>Construction of the CBD South station would displace homeless people and people who beg to other parts of the CBD</p>	MM365	<p>This was not considered within the Social and Community Impact Assessment. Some homeless people and people engaged in begging are likely to be displaced or choose to move from the CBD South station site as result of construction activities.</p> <p>As part of the community and business involvement plan (SC3) it would be expected that the project engage with the City of Melbourne, Victoria Police and agencies already tasked with addressing homelessness in the CBD.</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's
<p>Construction and operational impacts on public safety in the Domain precinct through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> changes to the 	MM061, MM089, MM118, MM190, MM193, MM196, MM201, MM202, MM204, MM276, MM290, MM295, MM319, MM349, MM367, MM370, MM330, MM333,	<p>Section 12.5.1.6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the Domain construction work site could generate concerns about human health and safety. Air quality modelling suggests that with management, air quality could be maintained within SEPP criteria, however on days when background particulate concentrations are high, there is the potential for air quality exceedances in the precinct (discussed further in Technical Appendix H Air Quality). This is likely to be of greater concern to vulnerable groups such</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
<p>road network and pedestrian access</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • loss of emergency access to buildings • changes in air quality • attraction of homeless people or anti-social behavior 	<p>MM346, MM358</p>	<p>as children and their parents or people with existing health conditions. This impact could be reduced through early engagement with concerned households. The interface between users of the precinct and construction activities could also be perceived to impact on safety, particularly for students at nearby schools, those with mobility impairments or children visiting the Domain Parklands. This impact could be reduced through early engagement with concerned households and stakeholders.</p> <p>Section 12.5.1.3 also notes that traffic management would be in place to maintain access to residences, the Shrine of Remembrance, Albert Park Clinic, Melbourne Grammar School and MacRobertson Girls' High School. This would include emergency vehicle access.</p> <p>It is not expected that the Domain station would act as an attractor of homeless people. It is expected that anti-social behavior would be managed through modern design standards and existing railway station protocols.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	
<p>Activities at the Fawkner Park southern TBM launch site negatively affect public safety</p>	<p>MM059, MM141, MM148, MM213, MM278</p>	<p>Technical Note 16 states that Fawkner Park is no longer required as a TBM launch site for the project, reducing project impacts in and around the park.</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
Construction activities will impact on public safety at the eastern portal	MM266, MM104, MM325	<p>Section 13.5.1.5 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the interface between users of the precinct and construction activities could be perceived to impact on safety. Pedestrians under the influence of alcohol or other drugs leaving licensed venues such as bars or nightclubs, those with mobility impairments or children would be particularly vulnerable to this. It is likely with appropriate traffic management and engagement with the local community and facilities that these concerns could be addressed.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Construction impacts on public safety in the western portal through changes to the road network and pedestrian access	MM031, MM042, MM050, MM092, MM093, MM097, MM102, MM106, MM114, MM122, MM136, MM144, MM145, MM150, MM156, MM158, MM161, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM210, MM223, MM238, MM271, MM282, MM293, MM309, MM077, MM340	<p>Section 8.5.1.5 notes that there is likely to be community concerns about the safety of truck movements and this may lead to changes in local access patterns. However, the small number of truck movements likely to be generated by the project, combined with appropriate traffic management and communication with the community, would minimise the likelihood of that occurring.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
<p>Construction activities sever existing networks and disrupt access patterns in the Domain precinct and Fawkner Park</p>	<p>MM190, MM215MM226, MM232, MM254, MM370</p>	<p>Section 12.5.1.3 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the concept design would require diversion of pedestrian and cycling traffic traveling alongside the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve but existing pedestrian access paths would be maintained. It would also require the rerouting of the number 8 tram along Toorak Road West. Traffic management would be in place to maintain access to residences, the Shrine of Remembrance, Albert Park Clinic, Melbourne Grammar School and MacRobertson Girls' High School. However, it is likely that local residents and users of these facilities would have to change their travel patterns, potentially increasing travel times. Most vulnerable to these changes are likely to be school students accessing MacRobertson Girls' High School, Melbourne Girls Grammar and Melbourne Grammar School, or people with mobility impairments unable to walk longer distances to access alternative transport options.</p> <p>It also notes that the Domain station precinct is expected to be subject to traffic delays during construction. Truck movements and changes to local access associated with project activities in Fawkner Park and with other private sector developments in the area would likely have a potential cumulative impact on local residents' access, particularly people living between Domain Road and Toorak Road West. There is a risk that increased congestion in the precinct would create social severance if people were unable to access their wider social networks or social infrastructure. The reported reliance of households in the precinct on private vehicles to shop, socialise and access employment, and the presence of vulnerable groups such as those with young children, mobility impairments or the elderly increases severity of this potential impact.</p> <p>Appropriate traffic management that allows for the needs for vulnerable people and early engagement with the community and affected facilities would reduce this impact. Construction workforce demand for parking could result in a reduction in parking available for residents, workers or other visitors to the area so would also require management.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. 	
<p>Construction activities will cause permanent changes to patterns of movements around the University of Melbourne</p>	<p>MM318</p>	<p>Section 10.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that pedestrian access across Grattan Street to access either campus of the University of Melbourne would be maintained but there may be delays for people traveling across campus accruing from construction activities. Delays in travel times across campus could require adjustments to timetabling and an extension of normal operating hours to accommodate classes. This could also result in changes to the range of classes being offered by the university during the peak of construction disruption. These disruptions will likely lead to changes in patterns of movement around the campus.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	<p>It is recommended that EPR T3 name the University of Melbourne and Melbourne Health as parties for consultation in the development of transport management measures</p>
<p>Construction traffic would sever existing networks and disrupt access patterns in the western portal</p>	<p>MM011, MM111, MM156, MM238, MM324</p>	<p>Section 8.5.1.5 notes that community concerns about the safety of truck movements may lead to changes in local access patterns under both options. However, the small number of truck movements likely to be generated by the project combined with appropriate traffic management and communication with the community would minimise the likelihood of that occurring.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise 	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		them of the planned construction activities and project progress.	
Displacement of Edmund Herring Memorial Oval users – EPR SC 6 needs to detail the outcomes being sought	MM365	<p>SC6 is as follows: Develop a relocation strategy for sports clubs and other formal users of directly impacted recreational facilities.</p> <p>The outcome being sought by this EPR is to, as far as is practicable, provide a mechanism through which the project can work with directly affected users and the City of Melbourne to identify appropriate alternative facilities where they exist. In the likely event there are insufficient facilities available locally, this strategy can, in consultation with stakeholders guide the identification of alternatives, if available, in adjoining local government areas.</p>	<p>Reword EPR SC6 as follows:</p> <p>In consultation with the City of Melbourne, develop a relocation strategy for sports clubs and other formal users of directly impacted recreational facilities. This strategy should aim, where available, to identify local alternative facilities without displacing existing users of alternative facilities</p>
Displacement of sporting clubs Submission notes that that the EPR significantly underestimates the difficulty of obtaining access to alternate sporting venues to	MM367	<p>Section 12.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the temporary occupation of the Edmund Herring Oval would displace existing users who have limited, if any, alternatives available locally.</p> <p>Table 6-1 in the social and community impact assessment acknowledges that it is likely that even with the application of the EPR SC6 that construction activity would displace organised sports given the limited number of local, available alternatives. It is unlikely the EPR proposed in the submission would be feasible without displacing other users.</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
<p>replace Edmund Herring Oval. It proposes to include the following EPR “MMRA should make arrangements with City of Melbourne for there to be a direct replacement of these facilities at Fawkner Park or another nearby reasonable alternative.</p>			
<p>Concerns about impacts on Fawkner Park including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • change in land use • loss of trees • disruption of amenity • disruption to passive and active recreation 	<p>MM370, MM002, MM046, MM059, MM212, MM213, MM365, MM322, MM204,</p>	<p>Technical note 16 states that Fawkner Park is no longer required as a TBM support site for the project, reducing the impacts on the Park and its users.</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>
<p>The Social and Community Impact</p>	<p>MM180</p>	<p>Section 11.5.1.2 notes that the placement of a construction work site on Franklin Street and activities on A'Beckett Street adjacent to RMIT have the potential to disrupt the</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
<p>Assessment does not provide sufficient information to understand the impact of the concept design on RMIT, its staff or students. An EPR is required to address this.</p>		<p>student and staff movements across campus. The delays that accrue from disruption could result in an inability of students or staff to get to classes on time necessitating a timetable change. RMIT has previously undergone several large developments and been able to maintain operations during their construction suggesting a degree of resilience to this kind of disruption. They are also planning a major redevelopment with the potential to disrupt student and staff movements but have been able to adapt timetables and class arrangements to suit. This impact can further be reduced through engagement with RMIT during planning and initial design of the project.</p> <p>Section 11.5.1.4 notes that RMIT would experience an ongoing amenity (noise) impact associated with the construction works in Franklin Street, potentially affecting the ability to use these facilities at times. This would be most pronounced during the demolition and the shaft construction stages of the works in the initial stages of construction.</p> <p>SC3 is intended to provide the flexibility to continue to engage with RMIT through the design and construction stages and incorporate feedback into the design and delivery of the project</p>	
<p>Construction activities will adversely affect household amenity in the Arden precinct</p>	<p>MM019, MM305, MM063, MM259, MM365, MM049, MM115, MM199, MM079, MM194</p>	<p>Section 9.5.1.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that with mitigation, construction is not expected to exceed existing background noise levels in the precinct. However, during construction the Concept Design would diminish the amenity of households particularly out of hours with truck movements on Macaulay Road and Wreckyn Street. Partially offsetting this impact would be the Concept Design's displacement of truck movements generated during the day by current Arden tenants such as the concrete batching plant. This impact could be reduced further through proactive communication with affected households, particularly for out of hours works.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise 	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		them of the planned construction activities and project progress	
Concerns about changes to amenity and impacts on dwellings due to the construction and operation of tunnels in North Melbourne	MM090, MM095, MM119, MM129, MM203, MM217, MM207, MM228, MM350, MM146, MM155, MM285, MM250, MM253, MM299, MM300, MM301	<p>Section 7.5.1.1 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the passing of the TBMs may trigger concerns about vibration and subsidence for affected households. The Concept Design could address these concerns for most households by providing appropriate information, demonstrating condition survey results and by relocating people where appropriate. However, it is likely to be a source of more sustained concern for some affected households.</p> <p>Section 7.5.1.2 also notes that the Concept Design may result in short-term acoustic or vibration impacts on residences while the TBM travel along the alignment. This impact could be managed for most households with the provision of appropriate information, demonstration of condition survey results and relocation where appropriate.</p> <p>As per the submissions it is agreed that this could be a source of ongoing concern for some affected households until the project is commissioned and acoustic and vibration performance validated.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity during the day for shift workers) • Loss of access. • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Impacts on	MM235, MM236, MM281,	Section 11.5.2.6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that construction	No change proposed

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
household amenity in CBD south and the loss of existing views	MM297	<p>in the Port Phillip Arcade site and 65-67 Swanston Street is likely to have a sustained amenity impact (noise and vibration) on adjoining buildings such as Bible House, UniLodge, Manchester House and Ashdown Apartments. The severity of this impact would be increased by the 24-hour nature of works occurring within the Port Phillip Arcade. There would also be several periods during construction where the vibration from road header activities could impact on human comfort (discussed further in Technical Appendix I Noise and Vibration). This impact could be reduced through early engagement with affected households and facilities. The impact for dwellings could be further reduced by making available the option of relocation for highly impacted households, particularly for sustained out of hours works.</p> <p>Section 11.5.2.4 notes that over-site development would also likely be inconsistent with the aspirations of the residents of Bible House and Ashdown Apartments, primarily for the impact it would have on their views towards the south. Diminishing the severity of this impact, the loss of views is a regular occurrence within the CBD. Apartment owners can reasonably expect to have their views disrupted given the planning controls and the ongoing level of redevelopment that is encouraged and occurs within the CBD.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity during the day for shift workers) • Loss of access. Develop and implement a traffic management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community 	to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress	
Impacts on residential amenity in the Domain precinct and Toorak Road	MM008, MM176, MM190, MM229, MM276, MM283, MM284, MM289, MM141, MM312, MM356, MM137, MM183, MM190, MM204, MM213, MM226, MM242, MM252, MM254, MM268, MM232, MM356, MM358, MM240, MM241, MM267, MM34, MM370, MM059, MM080, MM096, MM118, MM289, MM290, MM298, MM306, MM311, MM313, MM315, MM319, MM330, MM333, MM374	<p>Section 12.5.1.6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment found that construction would generate large volumes of noise and dust during working hours. This would have a sustained amenity impact on the precinct. Groups likely to experience the greatest potential impact include residents in proximity to works who are likely to be home during the day or whose bedrooms face St Kilda Road.</p> <p>It notes that the potential amenity impact would be attenuated through acoustic treatments but for some residents this is still likely to result in an observable diminishment of amenity particularly outside of normal working hours.</p> <p>This impact could be reduced through early engagement with these households and making available the option of relocation for highly impacted households, particularly for sustained out of hours works.</p> <p>Technical note 16 states that Fawkner Park is no longer required as a TBM launch site for the project, reducing the amenity impact for residents on Toorak Road. The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity workers) • Loss of access • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • LV3 Develop and implement measures to minimise light spillage during construction to protect the amenity of adjacent neighborhoods, parks and community facilities. • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values. 	
Impacts on residential amenity in the Eastern Portal precinct	MM010, MM264, MM012, MM019, MM104, MM164, MM325, MM348, MM352, MM266, MM339, MM354	<p>Section 13.5.1.5 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that during construction, residents adjoining South Yarra Siding Reserve and Lovers Walk would experience an improvement in amenity as acoustic treatments such as noise walls would reduce background noise from rail operations (discussed further in Technical Appendix I Noise and Vibration). However, they would experience a sustained loss of visual amenity with the placement of noise walls, loss of vegetation in both Osborne and South Yarra Sidings Reserves and construction activities. The use of Osborne, William and Arthur Streets for construction traffic is also likely to have a potential amenity impact for residents living on these streets. A large number of local residents, such as retirees, would probably be home during the day, increasing the severity of this impact.</p> <p>While amelioration treatments such as hoardings and the retention of trees (where possible) would be used to reduce visual impacts (discussed further in Technical Appendix L Landscape and Visual), there would still be amenity impacts associated with construction traffic traveling on local roads. The loss of vegetation is also likely to be of concern to the community given the limited availability of alternative vegetated parkland in proximity to South Yarra Siding Reserve.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p>	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity workers) • Loss of access • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values. 	
Impacts on residential amenity in Parkville	MM294, MM100	<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment did not consider the amenity impacts on residents of Gatehouse Drive associated with diverted traffic flows. However, if there was an increase in traffic on this road, pending the quantum and timing of the increase, this could have an impact on residential amenity.</p> <p>Amenity impacts on occupants of Graduate House were also not assessed within the assessment. However, it is likely they would be at times subject to amenity impacts associated with construction activities on University Square..</p> <p>The following EPRs would manage amenity impacts on residents of University House and Gatehouse Drive:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity workers) • Loss of access <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values. 	
Impacts on residential amenity in the Western Portal Precinct	MM007, MM050, MM014, MM101, MM106, MM111, MM161, MM230, MM238, MM239, MM270, MM011, MM042, MM077, MM078, MM092, MM097, MM120, MM122, MM124, MM140, MM152, MM154, MM156, MM165, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM192, MM205, MM210, MM069, MM070, MM072, MM075, MM093, MM102, MM150, MM158, MM271, MM309, MM323, MM324, MM149	<p>Section 8.5.1.5 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment found that both portal options are likely to affect the amenity of residences on Hobsons Road and Ormond and Altona Streets. It also noted that acoustic treatments such as a noise wall, if appropriately designed, could enhance the visual amenity of the properties looking towards the rail corridor. However, several properties on Altona and Ormond Streets would likely have their current views of trees and terrace houses replaced by a noise wall, which would have a negative impact on in their amenity from the rear of their properties and potentially alter their sense of place.</p> <p>Engagement with affected landholders on the design and appearance of the acoustic treatments could reduce this impact.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LV3 Develop and implement measures to minimise light spillage during construction to protect the amenity of adjacent neighborhoods, parks and community facilities. • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works or sustained loss of amenity during the day for shift workers) • Loss of access <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values. 	
<p>Need to minimise impacts on the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve and Shrine of Remembrance activities</p>	<p>MM173, MM175, MM176, MM193, MM249, MM256</p>	<p>Section 12.5.1.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that works with the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve are likely to be of concern to the wider community but that the potential for this would be reduced through appropriate engagement of the Shrine of Remembrance and avoidance of works at key times on Anzac and Remembrance Days.</p> <p>Further Section 12.5.1.4 also found the works would require the use of the western border of the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve. This would affect the amenity of the reserve and has the potential to disturb services and other activities taking place on the grounds. Construction activities in the reserve would also reduce the level of open space available to the community for passive recreation. The use of the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve for this purpose is likely to be considered a diminishment of this valued place. The loss of trees or interference with memorials and plaques, could lead to a diminishment of the sense of place at the reserve if done in a manner not supported by the Shrine of Remembrance. Diminishing this impact is the likelihood that much of the Shrine of Remembrance Reserve could be avoided with appropriate mitigation, with trees, plaques</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>and monuments protected during the works.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • SC5 Work with relevant local councils to plan for and coordinate with key stakeholders during major public events • LU1 Develop and implement measures for construction and operation of Melbourne Metro that aim to minimise impacts to the development and/or operation of existing land uses. 	
Impact on the St Kilda Road streetscape	MM151, MM176, MM229, MM234, MM242, MM215, MM004, MM089, MM128, MM137, MM153, MM172, MM173, MM175, MM176, MM183, MM188, MM189, MM190, MM193, MM196, MM200, MM201, MM202, MM214, MM215, MM218, MM226, MM232, MM240, MM241, MM252, MM256, MM260, MM267, MM268, MM283, MM284, MM290, MM298, MM306, MM311, MM312, MM313, MM315, MM319, MM322, MM333, MM336, MM343, MM346,	<p>Section 12.5.1.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes the loss of the trees on St Kilda Road is likely to be of concern to the local and wider community as this would represent a long stretch of vegetation loss in a valued leafy boulevard. Increasing the magnitude of this potential impact would be the length of time it would take to grow replacement trees.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • SC7 In consultation with key stakeholders and in accordance with the Urban Design Strategy, relevant statutory approvals and other relevant requirements, re-establish sites impacted by construction works. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
	MM349, MM365, MM370, MM374, MM356, MM244		
Uncertainty about potential project impacts on the ability of landowners to plan for the future	MM207, MM228, MM253, MM299, MM300, MM301, MM266, MM270, MM330	<p>Section 6 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment determined it likely that residential property owners subject to acquisition or in proximity to construction areas would postpone or reconsider their plans for their properties.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Construction activities will result in a loss of access to residences	MM049, MM229, MM012, MM240, MM266, MM080, MM089, MM096, MM137, MM153, MM183, MM196, MM199, MM202, MM232, MM204, MM211, MM241, MM268, MM276, MM283, MM289, MM290, MM298, MM313, MM349, MM306, MM330, MM346, MM244	<p>Consistent with any construction activity that occupies roadways, residences across the project alignment could experience short term loss of access to their properties. This is similar to what might occur with water main renewals or electrical works undertaken by utilities with established processes to manage impacts.</p> <p>Table 6-1 in the social and community and impact assessment recognises it is likely that dwellings in the eastern portal would experience a reduction or loss of access and that this was also possible in the CBD. With mitigation, it is unlikely this would occur in the CBD but it is still possible in the Eastern Portal.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • SC2 Prior to main works or shaft construction in areas affected, develop a relocation management framework that allows for a uniform approach across the project for the voluntary (temporary) relocation of households subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction activities likely to unduly affect their amenity (e.g. out of hours works 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>or sustained loss of amenity during the day for shift workers)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Loss of access • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. 	
Parking availability	MM025, MM049, M066,, MM093, MM259, MM310, MM080, MM094, MM118, MM135, MM153, MM190, MM196, MM201, MM202, MM204, MM218, MM226, MM232, MM240, MM249, MM260, MM267, MM268, MM276, MM283, MM289, MM290, MM312, MM315, MM333, MM349, MM356, MM367, MM370, MM008, MM059, MM213, MM104, MM266, MM339, MM348, MM352, MM354, MM294, MM014, MM033, MM070, MM071, MM086, MM092, MM099, MM101, MM103, MM110, MM120, MM122, MM136, MM140, MM144, MM145, MM154, MM156, MM158, MM165, MM167,	<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the construction workforce is likely to use public parking which would have a major consequence for the communities in the project precincts. With the mitigation proposed in the Social and Community Impact Assessment, namely the incorporation of a target of no net loss of public parking outside the construction zone and the management of workforce car parking to include subcontractors, this would be unlikely to occur.</p> <p>Section 8.5.1.3 also notes that temporary occupation of the Childers Street car parks during construction would likely to impact commuters who currently use the parks as well as people visiting the precinct to access facilities, or visiting family and friends.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • T1 Develop and implement a transport management plan(s) in consultation with the relevant road management authorities to minimise disruption to traffic, car parking, pedestrian and bicycle movements during construction. 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
	MM168, MM169, MM179, MM211, MM230, MM238, MM270, MM271, MM282, MM293, MM331, MM314, MM325, MM340		
Loss of access to the Albert Road Reserve during construction	MM229, MM252, MM312, MM183, MM196, MM240, MM260, MM268, MM311, MM315, MM370, MM256, MM267, MM322	<p>Section 12.5.1.2 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that the Concept Design would require the temporary occupation of the Albert Road Reserve, displacing current passive activities and precluding the use of the site for services by the National Boer War Memorial Association (Victoria). Reducing the severity of the impact, the reserve is not heavily used currently. With appropriate traffic management, users should also be able to access alternatives like the Domain Parklands or Albert Park. Engaging appropriately with the association and other interested stakeholders during reinstatement planning for the reserve and memorial would reduce this impact further.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • SC4 Prior to main works or shaft construction commencing, work with the City of Melbourne to identify possible alternative areas of public open space for community use during the construction phase to minimise the impacts of loss of existing public open space that are to be utilised as construction worksites. • SC7 In consultation with key stakeholders and in accordance with the Urban Design Strategy, relevant statutory approvals and other relevant requirements, re-establish sites impacted by construction works. • LU1 Develop and implement measures for construction and operation of Melbourne Metro that aim to minimise impacts to the development and/or operation of existing 	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		land uses.	
Property acquisition, and associated displacement of residents	MM371, MM014, MM033, MM042, MM045, MM047, MM050, MM056, MM071, MM072, MM078, MM086, MM092, MM093, MM097, MM099, MM101, MM102, MM106, MM110, MM111, MM113, MM114, MM120, MM122, MM124, MM125, MM136, MM140, MM154, MM156, MM158, MM161, MM165, MM167, MM168, MM169, MM179, MM223, MM230, MM238, MM239, MM243, MM248, MM270, MM271, MM282, MM286, MM293, MM302, MM307, MM323, MM331, MM340	<p>The Social and Community Impact Assessment considered the social impacts associated with the acquisition of dwellings at the western and eastern portals as well as in the CBD.</p> <p>The social risks associated with acquisition are captured in chapter 6 as the displacement of households and diminishment of networks within the surrounding community. The assessment found that following mitigation, the social risk in the western portal was high for the Concept Design, but low for the Alternative Design Option. The high rating is largely due to the limited availability of equivalent dwellings in the suburb and the close knit nature of the community that would be disrupted.</p> <p>The residual social risk associated with dwelling acquisition in the CBD was assessed as medium due to the availability of equivalent dwellings and the transitory nature of most affected tenants.</p> <p>The residual risk in the eastern portal was also assessed as medium given five of the seven acquired dwellings are vacant or proposed for multi-unit developments.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise them of the planned construction activities and project progress. • SC1 Reduce the disruption to residences from direct acquisition or temporary occupation 	No change proposed to existing EPR's
Loss of City Square during construction and ongoing changes	MM317, MM304, MM310	Section 11.5.2.5 notes that during construction, City Square would be occupied by construction activities and no longer able to host special events and other activities potentially resulting in a loss of some of these events and the relocation of others. The site would also no longer be available for passive recreation. Increasing the severity of this impact is the limited number of alternative sites available within the CBD. The nearest	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>alternative open spaces are either Federation Square approximately 4 minutes south or the State Library 10 minutes' walk north along Swanston Street. The loss of this site during construction could be offset via the provision of comparable open space elsewhere nearby for use by the community such as Cathedral Place.</p> <p>Once operational, the Concept Design would increase the use of City Square as people access the station via the eastern entrance. An increase in pedestrian traffic could alter the current use of the site for passive recreation and interfere with formal events held on site (e.g. fashion week or the comedy festival) as well as informal activities. The placement of the City Square entrance could also result in the ongoing displacement of some of these activities. The disruption to activities in City Square could impact on the social networks of groups within the community who have limited alternatives available to them.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC8 In consultation with the City of Melbourne, improve community access to open or recreational space within the CBD by identifying potential opportunities to return as much land as possible used for construction to permanent public open space at City Square and Federation Square. Plans must be in accordance with the Melbourne Metro Urban Design Strategy • SC5 Work with relevant local councils to plan for and coordinate with key stakeholders during major public events • SC4 Prior to main works or shaft construction commencing, work with the City of Melbourne to identify possible alternative areas of public open space for community use during the construction phase to minimise the impacts of loss of existing public open space that are to be utilised as construction worksites. 	
Amenity impacts on University Square	MM100, MM285, MM364	The Social and Community Impact Assessment does not identify any ongoing amenity impacts on University Square once it is reinstated.	No change proposed to existing EPR's

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>The following draft EPR and related mitigation is proposed to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC7 In consultation with key stakeholders and in accordance with the Urban Design Strategy, relevant statutory approvals and other relevant requirements, re-establish sites impacted by construction works 	
<p>Loss of South Yarra Siding Reserve and Osborne Reserve during construction</p>	<p>MM266, MM264, MM352</p>	<p>Section 13.5.1.4 of the Social and Community Impact Assessment notes that during construction Lovers Walk, South Yarra Siding Reserve and Osborne Street Reserve would be heavily modified and inaccessible during construction. The South Yarra Siding Reserve is an important asset for the local community with limited alternatives locally (the nearest being Fawkner Park, Como Park or Rockley Gardens). Ongoing there would be noise walls placed on the eastern boundary of the Reserve.</p> <p>Pending the nature of reinstatement, this could enhance the function and appearance of this reserve. Lovers Walk would also be significantly altered during construction with access constrained. Ongoing it would have noise walls installed and vegetation removed, which could enhance or detract from its perceived sense of place.</p> <p>Osborne Street Reserve would also host ventilation and access shafts restricting future uses of the northern extent of this park. While the Osborne Street Reserve is not highly utilised, the adjoining community values it as a vegetated screen from the rail corridor. Pending the final design, the reinstatement of the reserve could either diminish or enhance it for the adjoining community.</p> <p>The social impacts associated with changes to these valued places can be managed through engagement with the affected community during reinstatement planning to understand preferences and through the application of appropriate landscaping and treatments for above ground infrastructure.</p> <p>The following EPRs have been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC3 Prior to main works or shaft construction, develop and implement a community and business involvement plan to engage potentially affected stakeholders and advise 	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
		<p>them of the planned construction activities and project progress.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC7 In consultation with key stakeholders and in accordance with the Urban Design Strategy, relevant statutory approvals and other relevant requirements, re-establish sites impacted by construction works. • LV1 Design permanent and temporary works in consultation with local councils and the Office of Victorian Government Architect to comply with the MMRA Urban Design Strategy. The design shall avoid or minimise visual impacts on sensitive receptors and maintain broader landscape character values. 	
<p>The project need to continue to engage closely with affected landholders, households and stakeholders throughout planning and construction and establish a complaints management system</p>	<p>MM350, MM367, MM203, MM095, MM164, MM250, MM259, MM289, MM354</p>	<p>It is expected that as part of EPR SC3, MMRA and the constructor would establish a number of mechanisms through which the community and stakeholders can be informed about project progress and activities of direct relevance to them. It is also expected that a complaints management system would be established that provides a timely and transparent process by which people can contact the project and get issues resolved.</p>	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>
<p>Reinstatement of acquired land may result in developments inconsistent with community aspirations</p>	<p>MM124, MM111, MM019, MM164, MM264</p>	<p>It is expected in most instances, land will be reinstated in accordance with existing zoning and planning controls.</p> <p>The following EPR has been recommended to manage this issue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC7 In consultation with key stakeholders and in accordance with the Urban Design Strategy, relevant statutory approvals and other relevant requirements, re-establish sites impacted by construction works. 	<p>No change proposed to existing EPR's</p>

Issue	Submission No.	Response	Any Recommended New or Modified Environmental Performance Requirement
Social impact study does not demonstrate how individuals feel about using underground stations	MM023	This was not within the scope of the social and community impact assessment. However, it is assumed that the community would be comfortable about using underground stations given their existing use of the Melbourne Underground Rail Loop.	
Business impacts	MM037, MM038, MM058, MM085, MM157, MM163, MM184, MM186, MM263, MM372	These are relevant to the Business Impact Assessment (Appendix G).	N/A